

Michael P. Kenny, Esq. (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
mike.kenny@alston.com

Debra D. Bernstein, Esq. (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
debra.bernstein@alston.com

Matthew D. Kent (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
matthew.kent@alston.com

**ALSTON & BIRD LLP**  
1201 West Peachtree Street  
Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3424  
Tel: (404) 881-7000  
Fax: (404) 881-7777

James M. Wagstaffe, Esq. (SBN 95535)  
wagstaffe@kerrwagstaffe.com

**KERR & WAGSTAFFE LLP**  
100 Spear Street, 18th Floor  
San Francisco, California 94105-1576  
Tel: (415) 371-8500  
Fax: (415) 371-0500

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Dell Inc. and Dell Products L.P.*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

In re: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION

This Document Relates to Individual Case No.  
3:13-cv-02171-SC

Master File No. 3:07-cv-05944-SC (N.D. Cal.)  
MDL No. 1917

DELL INC. and DELL PRODUCTS L.P.,

Plaintiffs,

v.

HITACHI, LTD., *et al.*,

Defendants.

Individual Case No. 3:13-cv-02171-SC

**DECLARATION OF DEBRA D.  
BERNSTEIN IN SUPPORT OF  
PLAINTIFFS' MOTION TO PARTIALLY  
EXCLUDE CERTAIN OPINIONS AND  
EXPERT TESTIMONY OF EXPERT  
DANIEL L. RUBINFELD**

1 I, **DEBRA D. BERNSTEIN**, declare as follows:

2 1. I am a Partner with the law firm of Alston & Bird LLP, counsel for Plaintiffs Dell Inc.  
3 and Dell Products L.P. (collectively, "Dell") in the above-captioned action currently pending in the  
4 U.S. District Court for the Northern District of California. I submit this Declaration in support of  
5 Plaintiffs' Motion to Partially Exclude Certain Opinions and Testimony of Designated Expert Daniel L.  
6 Rubinfeld ("Dell's Rubinfeld Motion").

7 2. I am a member in good standing of the State Bar of Georgia and am admitted to practice  
8 before the U.S. District Court for the Northern District of Georgia. Pursuant to the Court's Pretrial  
9 Order No. 1 in the MDL Proceeding, I have been admitted *pro hac vice* in this litigation.

10 3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit A** is a true and correct copy of the August 5, 2014, Expert  
11 Report of Daniel L. Rubinfeld ("Rubinfeld Report").

12 4. Attached hereto as **Exhibit B** is a true and correct copy of the Samsung SDI Co., Ltd.'s  
13 ("Samsung SDI") plea of guilty in *United States v. Samsung SDI Co., Ltd.*, No. 3:11-CR-00162 (N.D.  
14 Cal.), entered on May 12, 2011.

15 5. Attached hereto as **Exhibit C** is a true and correct copy of the August 5, 2014, Expert  
16 Report of Dennis Carleton ("Carleton Report").

17 6. Attached hereto as **Exhibit D** are true and correct copies of portions of the Transcript of  
18 the September 8, 2014, Deposition of Daniel L. Rubinfeld.

19 I declare under penalty of perjury under the laws of the United States of America that the  
20 foregoing is true and correct.

21 Executed on December 5, 2014, in Atlanta, Georgia.

22 /s/ Debra D. Bernstein

23 Debra D. Bernstein, Esq.  
24 ALSTON & BIRD LLP  
25 1201 West Peachtree Street  
26 Atlanta, Georgia 30309-3424  
27 Tel: (404) 881-7000  
28 Facsimile: (404) 881-7777  
debra.bernstein@alston.com

*Attorney for Plaintiffs Dell Inc. and Dell Products L.P*